

Court of Appeals, Division One

Civil Appeal

1 CA-CV 25-0245

ECHEVARRIA, et al. v. GOOD HEALTH, et al.

Appellate Case Information

Case Filed: 27-Mar-2025

Case Closed:

Dept/Composition

Department B

Hon. Michael S Catlett
Hon. Angela K Paton
Hon. Jennifer M Perkins

Side 1. ALEXIS ORTIZ ECHEVARRIA, et al., Plaintiff/Appellant

(Litigant Group) ALEXIS ORTIZ ECHEVARRIA, et al.

- Alexis Ortiz Echevarria
Jessie Acosta Valentin

Co-Cnsl for: Plaintiffs/Appellants

Luis P Guerra, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 15768)
David C Shapiro, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 28056)
David L Abney, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 9001)

Side 2. GOOD HEALTH MEDICAL, PC, et al., Defendant/Appellee

(Litigant Group) GOOD HEALTH MEDICAL, PC, et al.

- Good Health Medical PC
MDN
Good Health Financial PC
Norah Parker

Attorneys for: Defendants/Appellees

Bruce D Crawford, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 9061)
Rita J Bustos, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 25956)

CASE STATUS

May 18, 2026...Decision Rendered

Table with 6 columns: PREDECESSOR CASE(S), Cause/Charge/Class, Judgment/Sentence, Judge, Role <Comments>, Trial, Dispo

3 OPEN DUE DATES

- Motion for Reconsideration Due Due By: Tuesday, June 2, 2026
Response to Costs Due Due By: Thursday, June 11, 2026
Petition for Review to ASC Due Due By: Wednesday, June 17, 2026

PENDING MATTER

General Motion Filed: 28-May-2026
Verified Statement of Costs (Appellee)

CASE DECISION

18-May-2026 MEMORANDUM DECISION

Angela Paton.....Author
Michael Catlett.....Concur
Jennifer Perkins.....Concur

Filed: 18-May-2026 Mandate:
Decision Disposition
Affirmed

64 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

- 1. 27-Mar-2025 FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appeal from Maricopa County Superior Court filed 02/26/25
2. 27-Mar-2025 FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries Exhibits: None sent with e-Record
3. 27-Mar-2025 FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: Appellant's Fee/Case Management Statement/Brief Due

Court of Appeals, Division One**Civil Appeal****1 CA-CV 25-0245****ECHEVARRIA, et al. v. GOOD HEALTH, et al.****64 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

4. 15-Apr-2025 RECEIPT No.: 2025-00398 ; \$330.00, Authorization: #05014090745, Applied to: ALEXIS ORTIZ ECHEVARRIA, et al. - Class A Filing Fee (\$330.00) Paid for: Liddy Legal Support Services - By nCourt LLC
5. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Notice of Filing Transcripts; Certificate of Service of Notice of Filing Transcripts; Reporter's Transcript - 04/16/2024 - Excerpt from the Transcript of Proceedings via Zoom - Jury Deliberation Question (Jeffrey W Bartelt) (Appellants)
6. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/16/2024 - Excerpts from the Transcript of Proceedings (Jeffrey W Bartelt) (Appellants)
7. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/04/2024 - Excerpt from the Transcript of Proceedings (Jeffrey W Bartelt) (Appellants)
8. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/02/2024 - Excerpt from the Transcript of Proceedings (Jeffrey W Bartelt) (Appellants)
9. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/04/2024 - Excerpt from the Transcript of Proceedings Direct Examination of Jennifer Huddleston, P.A (Jeffrey W Bartelt) (Appellants)
10. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/11/2024 - Excerpts from the Transcript of Proceedings (Examination of Norah Parker, PA) (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellants)
11. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/10/2024 - Excerpts from the Transcript of Proceedings (Examination of Norah Parker, PA) (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellants)
12. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/09/2024 - Excerpts from the Transcript of Proceedings (Examination of Norman Bizon, PA-C, CTH) (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellants)
13. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/02/2024 - Excerpt from the Transcript of Proceedings Testimony of Paul Budnick, M.D (Jeffrey W Bartelt) (Appellants)
14. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/10/2024 - Excerpts from the Transcript of Proceedings Direct, Cross and Redirect of Payam Zamani (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellants)
15. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 03/01/2024 - Final Trial Management Conference (Jeffrey W Bartelt) (Appellants)
16. 15-Apr-2025 FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 03/02/2022 - Videotaped Disposition of Noah Natchielli Parker, PA-C (Haley Dawn Westra) (Appellants)
17. 16-Apr-2025 FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellants)
18. 16-Apr-2025 FILED: Notice of Association of Counsel; Certificate of Service (Appellees)
19. 17-Apr-2025 FILED: Defendants/Appellees' Motion to Suspend Appeal and Revest Jurisdiction in the Superior Court Pursuant to ARCAP Rule 3; Certificate of Service (Appellees)
20. 18-Apr-2025 FILED: Notice of Errata; Certificate of Service of Notice of Errata (Appellants)
21. 18-Apr-2025 ORDERED: Vacating the 05/27/2025 due date for the opening brief. The order ruling on the pending motion will set a due date to file the opening brief. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
22. 22-Apr-2025 RECEIPT No.: 2025-00462 ; \$165.00, Authorization: #12014174545, Applied to: GOOD HEALTH MEDICAL, PC, et al. - Class B Filing Fee (\$165.00) Paid for: Jones Skelton & Hochuli PLC - By nCourt LLC
23. 2-May-2025 ORDERED: Defendants/Appellees' Motion to Suspend Appeal and Revest Jurisdiction in the Superior Court Pursuant to ARCAP Rule 3 (Appellees) = GRANTED and staying this appeal until 06/02/2025. FURTHER ORDERED: Revesting jurisdiction in the Maricopa County Superior Court and authorizing that court to consider the amended statement of costs. This court does not express an opinion regarding the merits of that motion. FURTHER ORDERED: The stay will be lifted automatically on 06/03/2025, unless before that date appellees file a motion to continue the stay of this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Within 10 days after the superior court rules on the motion, appellees must file a notice in this court with the ruling attached. FURTHER ORDERED: If a party wants this court to review any additional rulings, that party must file a timely notice of appeal or amended notice of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: The opening brief is due by 07/07/2025. If the brief is not timely filed, this court will dismiss this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
24. 3-Jun-2025 FILED: Defendant/Appellees' Motion to Continue Stay of Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellees)
25. 3-Jun-2025 ORDERED: Defendant/Appellees' Motion to Continue Stay of Appeal (Appellees) = GRANTED and continuing the stay of this appeal until 07/07/2025, for the purposes set forth in this court's 05/02/2025 stay order. FURTHER ORDERED: Stay will be lifted automatically on 07/08/2025, unless before that date appellants file a motion to continue the stay of the appeal that describes the status of the statement of costs. FURTHER ORDERED: If a party wants this court to review any additional rulings, that party must file a timely notice of appeal or amended notice of appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Opening brief is due by 08/07/2025. If the brief is not timely filed, this court will dismiss this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
26. 17-Jun-2025 FILED: Notice of Ruling; Certificate of Service (Appellees)
27. 17-Jun-2025 FILED: Notice of Filing of First Amended Appeal; Certificate of Service of Notice of Filing of First Amended Appeal (Appellants)
28. 18-Jun-2025 ORDERED: Lifting stay of this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Opening brief is due by 08/07/2025. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will dismiss this appeal. FURTHER ORDERED: Directing the Clerk of the Court to send the Notice of Filing First Amended Appeal filed on 06/17/2025, to the clerk of Maricopa County Superior Court. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author

Court of Appeals, Division One

Civil Appeal

1 CA-CV 25-0245

ECHEVARRIA, et al. v. GOOD HEALTH, et al.

64 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

29.	23-Jun-2025	FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record (Includes Amended Final Judgment and Notice of Filing of First Amended Appeal)
30.	9-Jul-2025	FILED: Notice of Transcript Order; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
31.	9-Jul-2025	FILED: Notice of Appearance of Attorney David L. Abney; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
32.	10-Jul-2025	FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: Appellee's Fee Paid 4/22/2025; Appellant's Brief Due
33.	11-Jul-2025	FILED: Settlement Conference Program Notice
34.	11-Jul-2025	FILED: Amended Settlement Conference Program Notice
35.	1-Aug-2025	FILED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order Extending Due Date for the Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellants)
36.	4-Aug-2025	ORDERED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order Extending Due Date for the Opening Brief (Appellants) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Thursday, 08-07-2025 to Tuesday, 09-02-2025. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will dismiss this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
37.	1-Sep-2025	FILED: Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
38.	30-Sep-2025	FILED: Appellees Good Health Medical, P.C. DBA MyDrNow and Norah Parker's Unopposed Motion to Extend Time to File Answering Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellees)
39.	30-Sep-2025	ORDERED: Appellees Good Health Medical, P.C. DBA MyDrNow and Norah Parker's Unopposed Motion to Extend Time to File Answering Brief (Appellees) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Tuesday, 10-14-2025 to Friday, 11-07-2025. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will submit this appeal for decision on the record and the opening brief. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
40.	6-Nov-2025	FILED: Appellees' Answering Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
41.	26-Nov-2025	FILED: Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellants)
42.	12-Jan-2026	FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days
43.	22-Jan-2026	FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record
44.	26-Jan-2026	CLNDR: CONFERENCE, Department B, 3-31-26, COURTROOM 1.
45.	31-Mar-2026	ORDERED: resetting conference in this matter for 4/21/26. FURTHER ORDERED: setting oral argument in this matter for 4/21/26 at 11:00 am in Courtroom 1. Each side is allocated 20 minutes within which to present oral argument. Hon Michael S Catlett - Author
46.	1-Apr-2026	FILED: Return Receipt Re Oral Argument, signed by David Abney, on 3/31/26 (Appellant)
47.	6-Apr-2026	FILED: Return Receipt Re Oral Argument, signed by Rita Bustos on 4/6/26 (Appellee)
48.	9-Apr-2026	ORDERED: that, in addition to the issues raised in the briefs, counsel should be prepared to address the following questions and provide relevant authority at oral argument (See Order). Hon Michael S Catlett - Author
49.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/16/2024 (9:30 AM) (Jeffrey Bartelt) (Unsigned) (Appellant)
50.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/16/2024 (2:59 PM) (Jeffrey Bartelt) (Unsigned) (Appellant)
51.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Motion to Have the Trial Transcripts Considered on Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
52.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/02/2024 - (Jeffrey W. Bartelt) (Unsigned) (Appellant)
53.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/03/2024 - (Jeffrey W. Bartelt) (Unsigned) (Appellant)
54.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/04/2024 - (Jeffrey W. Bartelt) (Unsigned) (Appellant)
55.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/08/2024 - (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellant)
56.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/09/2024 - (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellant)
57.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/10/2024 - (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellant)
58.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/11/2024 - (Shannon Stevenson) (Appellant)
59.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 04/15/2024 - (Jeffrey Bartelt) (Unsigned) (Appellant)
60.	21-Apr-2026	FILED: Sign-in Sheet/Case is Under Advisement as of 04/21/2026
61.	6-May-2026	ORDERED: Motion to Have the Trial Transcripts Considered on Appeal (Appellant) = GRANTED. Hon Michael S Catlett - Author

Court of Appeals, Division One

Civil Appeal

1 CA-CV 25-0245

ECHEVARRIA, et al. v. GOOD HEALTH, et al.

64 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

- | | | |
|-----|-------------|---|
| 62. | 18-May-2026 | MEMORANDUM DECISION (Affirmed) Hon Angela K Paton - Author; Hon Michael S Catlett - Concur; Hon Jennifer M Perkins - Concur |
| 63. | 18-May-2026 | FILED: Decision Distribution Notification |
| 64. | 28-May-2026 | FILED: Verified Statement of Costs; Certificate of Service (Appellee) |